12-22 PEGASUS GROUP

LANDSCAPE STATEMENT OF COMMON GROUND

Between: Bradford Metropolitan District Council & Mr. Andrew Calvert

Horn Crag Quarry, Fishbeck Lane, Silsden

Re-opening of Horn Crag Quarry for the purposes of releasing a proven locally distinctive building stone resource

Appeal Reference: - APP/W4705/W/23/3332884

Date Of Hearing / Inquiry:

20th – 22nd February, 27th – 29th February, 6th – 7th March 2024

Date: 30th January 2024 | Pegasus Ref: P23-1784

PINS Ref: APP/W4705/W/23/3332884 | LPA Ref: 23/00829/MCF





Contents.

1.	Introduction	3
2.	Site Location and Description	.4
3.	Landscape and Visual Appraisal	.5
4.	The Appeal Proposal	.6
5.	Application Plans and Documents	7
6.	Landscape and Visual Baseline	. 8
7.	Matters that Remain in Dispute	.9



1. Introduction

1.1.

This appeal relates to the refusal of planning application 23/00829/MCF with the Decision Notice issued 24th of May 2023, stating four Reasons for Refusal (RfRs). This LSoCG relates only to the second RfR, which states:

"2. The proposal as submitted is unacceptable, as it will not make a positive contribution towards the conservation, management and enhancement of the diversity of landscapes within the designated landscape character area of the Rombalds Ridge Landscape Character Area. The change is not considered acceptable, as it will have adverse landscape and visual effects, particularly in relation to; the loss of an area of distinct character and a local landmark within the broader character area; the significant impact on recreational use due to the visual impact of the quarry works; the length of disruption and disturbance locally and on the broader enjoyment of the surrounding Landscape over a minimum of 20 years with potentially an additional 15 years to achieve some maturity in the restored scheme; the adverse visual impacts on amenity for residential properties; the adverse impacts on tourism; and the adverse impacts on recreation.

As such, the proposal is contrary to policies EN4, DS2, DS5, EN1 EC4 (F) and EN9 (3) of the Bradford Core Strategy, the Landscape Character Assessment SPD for Rombalds Ridge and SWES5 and SWES6 of The Steeton with Eastburn and Silsden Neighbourhood Development Plan."

1.2. The purpose of this LSoCG is to identify the areas where the principal parties (the Appellant and the LPA) are in agreement and to narrow down the issues that remain in dispute. This will allow the Public Inquiry to focus on the most pertinent issues. This LSoCG should be read in conjunction with other SoCGs which have been prepared for the purpose of this Public Inquiry.



2. Site Location and Description

- 2.1. The Site is located approximately 1.9km to the northeast of the centre of Silsden and approximately 3km to the southwest of the centre of Addingham, at grid reference SE 05303 47994, and as shown in drawing ref: 232/5 1. The total site area would be approximately 5.9ha, which includes a short access track. The proposed extraction area would be approximately 3.92ha.
- 2.2. Approximately 3Ha of the Site has been subject to mineral extraction and associated operations. This includes elements of working that were subject to enforcement action. The remaining areas are rough pasture, areas of heathland, and some other areas, the nature of which is subject to dispute and is referred to under the heading disagreement below.
- 2.3. The previous quarry operations fit within the definition of being small scale, primarily 100+yrs ago (with some disturbance some 40 years ago in the 1980s).
- 2.4. The topography as shown in the appellants drawings shows the Site ranges from 232m AOD in the west of The Site, to 256m AOD in the northeast of The Site. The base of the historic quarry face is 241m AOD and the top of the face is 248m AOD as shown in the appellants drawings.
- 2.5. Existing levels are shown on the appellants drawings E454–001 and E454–002.

The Surrounding Area

- 2.6. The Site is abutted by agricultural fields on all sides.
- 2.7. The nearest residential properties are off Fishbeck Lane, the closest (at approx. 145m) to the south west, having a stable/equestrian business. To the north and approx. 220m from the redline boundary is a permanent residential caravan park, Cringles Caravan and to the south east and approx. 425m from the site is Brown Bank Caravan Park which is a mixture of holiday/semi-permanent residential.



3. Landscape and Visual Appraisal

- 3.1. The planning application 23/00829/MCF was supported by a Landscape and Visual Appraisal (LVA), Revision C dated 24th January 2023, and prepared by Collington Winter Environmental (**CD 01-14**).
- 3.2. The LVA photographs have been taken from a number of representative and illustrative viewpoints in the landscape surrounding the appeal site, both in terms of views of the appeal site and its immediate landscape context, the nearby receptors, and the wider surrounding countryside. The LVA viewpoints are appropriate and proportionate to the appeal scheme, given its typology and limited complexity.
- 3.3. The viewpoint selection had been coordinated and agreed with the Council. Following the initial landscape comments received from the Council in April 2022, further viewpoints (Viewpoints 17 to 22) were added to consider the potential effects upon the residents associated with the Cringles Park Home Estate and those located to the west of the appeal site. The additional viewpoints were concerned with residential visual amenity i.e. 'impact on settlements' in close proximity to the appeal site. Though it is acknowledged that not all of the LVA viewpoints are public vantage points.



4. The Appeal Proposal

- 4.1. The appeal proposal is for extraction of stone with the operational phase of the appeal scheme being limited to 20 years.
- 4.2. With reference to the to the Arboricultural Impact Assessment Plus Tree Survey (**CD 01-28**), Groups G21 and G22, and a small part of G24 would be removed to accommodate Phase 1 of the appeal scheme.
- 4.3. The proposed diversions of Public Footpath Footpaths Silsden 18 and 19 are shown on drawing ref: 232/5 –5 (**CD 01-39**), which would include proposed amended surfacing and dry stone wall crossing points.



5. Application Plans and Documents

- 5.1. The application plans and supporting documents that comprised the planning application at the time that the appeal was lodged are listed on the Council's planning portal. Those that are specifically informative to this LSoCG include the following:
 - Landscape & Visual Appraisal (LVA), Revision C dated 24th January 2023, and prepared by Collington Winter Environmental (CD 01–14).
 - Photomontages prepared by The Mineral Planning Group Ltd (CD 01-45, 01-46, and 01-47).
 - Arboricultural Impact Assessment Plus Tree Survey dated November 2021, and prepared by Brooks Ecological (CD 01-28).
- 5.2. The following supporting document and plan was submitted as an appendix to the Appellant LS PoE::
 - Optional Landscape Mitigation Proposals Plan (drawing number 232/5 16, Revision 1.0, prepared by The Mineral Planning Group Ltd), Appendix 2 to the Appellant's Landscape Proof of Evidence.
- 5.3. Relevant Council Comments and PoE can be found: in the Core Documents
 - ID-03 BMDC Statement of Case
 - ID-04 Statement of Common Ground
 - ID-06 Council Planning Proof of Evidence
 - 03-05 Landscape Consultee Response 15th May 2023
 - ID-08 Council Landscape Proof of Evidence



6. Landscape and Visual Baseline

- 6.1. It is agreed that at a national level the appeal site and the surrounding areas are located within Natural England's National Character Area (NCA) 36 'South Pennines' (**CD 11-07**). It is agreed that this NCA is geographically extensive, and the broad characteristics are generally present and identifiable within the local area.
- 6.2. It is agreed that in the published *Landscape Character Supplementary Planning Document* (October 2008) (page 5) (**CD 07-01**), the appeal site is identified as being located within the Rombalds Ridge Landscape Character Area (LCA) and its associated Upland Pasture Landscape Character Type (LCT).



7. Matters that Remain in Dispute

7.1. The issues that remain in dispute between the Appellant and the Council can be narrowed down to the following:

Whether the development gives rise to unacceptable Landscape effects including unacceptable adverse impacts on recreational use; disruption and disturbance locally and on the broader enjoyment of the surrounding Landscape; the unacceptable adverse visual impacts on amenity for residential properties; the adverse impacts on tourism; and the adverse impacts on recreation.

Whether the land is a Valued Landscape.



Town & Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended) Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004

Expertly Done.

DESIGN | ECONOMICS | ENVIRONMENT | HERITAGE | LAND & PROPERTY | PLANNING | TRANSPORT & INFRASTRUCTURE

All paper sources from sustainably managed forests Pegasus Group is a trading name of Pegasus Planning Group Limited (07277000) registered in England and Wales.

Registered office: Querns Business Centre, Whitworth Road, Cirencester, Gloucestershire, GL7 1RT We are ISO certified 9001, 14001, 45001



PEGASUSGROUP.CO.UK